

Thirty-Seventh Plenary Meeting May 5-6, 2016



Executive Summary

Threat Reduction Advisory Committee

This is a report of the Threat Reduction Advisory Committee (TRAC).

The TRAC is a Federal Advisory Committee established to provide independent advice to the Secretary of Defense. Statements, opinions, conclusions, and recommendations in this report do not necessarily represent the official position of the Department of Defense (DoD) or any other entity of the United States Government.



June 14, 2016

**MEMORANDUM FOR THE OFFICE OF THE ASSISTANT SECRETARY OF DEFENSE FOR
NUCLEAR, CHEMICAL AND BIOLOGICAL DEFENSE PROGRAMS**

SUBJECT: Executive Summary of the Thirty-Seventh Meeting of the Department of Defense
Threat Reduction Advisory Committee Calendar Year 2015 Activities Report

This memorandum formally transmits the Threat Reduction Advisory Committee's Executive Summary of the Thirty-Seventh Plenary meeting held May 5-6, 2016 in Arlington, VA and Washington, D.C.

Ambassador Ronald F. Lehman, II
Chair
Threat Reduction Advisory Committee

OPR: J2/5/8R-AC (Advisory Committees and Programs Office)

DATE: June 14, 2016

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY BLANK

Threat Reduction Advisory Committee

Thirty-Seventh Plenary Meeting

Executive Summary

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY 1

ANNEX A: Plenary Meeting Agenda 6

ANNEX B: Plenary Attendees. 8

ANNEX C: Current Members 10

ANNEX D: TRAC Management Staff..... 12

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Thirty-Seventh meeting of the Department of Defense (DoD) Threat Reduction Advisory Committee (TRAC) convened at CENTRA Technologies, Inc., Arlington, Virginia, May 5 – 6, 2016.

In accordance with Section 10(d) of the Federal Advisory Committee Act, as amended, 5 U.S.C. Appendix and 41 C.F.R. § 102-3.155, it was determined that this meeting of the TRAC concerned classified information and matters covered by 5 U.S.C. § 552b(c)(1) and as such, the meeting was closed to the public. The meeting subject matter involved classified information directly related to national security issues. Access to such information is limited to personnel with appropriate security clearances and a specific “need to know.” Disclosure of the TRAC deliberations would have a grave impact on U.S. national security. While all activities were announced in the Federal Register, the public was not invited in order to protect U.S. National Security. Appendices A and B list the meeting agenda and attendees.

TRAC Designated Federal Officer, Mr. William Hostyn, opened the Thirty-Seventh TRAC Plenary by introducing new TRAC support staff in attendance. He then provided an overview of the plenary agenda and reminded all members that TRAC notebooks were limited to secret material only. Mr. Hostyn concluded his remarks and turned the meeting over to the TRAC Chair, Ambassador (Amb.) Ronald Lehman.

Amb. Lehman’s opening remarks referenced recent comments made by Secretary of Defense (SECDEF) Carter and the Committee’s own ambitious agenda as to how much work the Committee had to look forward to in the coming year. Adding that growing interest in non-state actors and concerns for new bioengineering technology may lead to additional studies for the TRAC. He then reminded the members that their work provided real-time answers to real issues and the resulting TRAC reports are a lasting source of information. He cited the TRAC’s work on the DoD response to the Ebola outbreak in West Africa and the recommendations found in the TRAC’s Global Health Security Report as an example of the important work of the Committee.

Amb. Lehman then addressed the SECDEF’s guidance regarding the management of Committee membership. A majority of the current members were appointed as a group and thus their terms of service will expire at the same time according to the DoD’s Committee Management Office that oversees these issues. Amb. Lehman told the members that he would like to hear from members, who for a variety of reasons, may be ready to leave the TRAC. If there are no volunteers then TRAC leadership and the sponsor would be proactive in managing the Committee membership numbers. He closed stating the TRAC is valuable because it is discrete; comments about TRAC activities should stay within the TRAC meeting spaces and its members. He added that the only findings that are releasable are those that have been briefed to the sponsor and

deliberated upon by the full TRAC. In other words, the work of the preparatory groups (prep groups) is preliminary research used to support the findings of the TRAC and are not, by themselves, approved findings or recommendations.

Dr. Hopkins was unable to attend as originally scheduled, instead, he provided his remarks on day two.

Following Amb. Lehman's remarks Dr. Glenn Sjoden and Captain Timothy Genda from the Air Force Technical Applications Center (AFTAC) provided an overview of the AFTAC mission, its capabilities, and new initiatives AFTAC was pursuing with the interagency. The briefing led to multiple questions by the TRAC members of AFTAC activities specifically in relation to ongoing studies the TRAC is examining. The majority of this discussion was held at the classified level.

Mr. Aaron Wessells and other representatives of the intelligence community followed AFTAC. The group delivered a series of classified briefings on North Korea addressing capabilities, intelligence collection, and threats posed to the U.S. These briefings generated much discussion and were of particular interest due to the on-going Committee studies on China and North Korea.

Due to the change in the agenda, TRAC members Honorable (Hon.) Michael Nacht and Ms. Eileen Vergino provided the Countering Weapons of Mass Destruction (CWMD): A Case Study of North Korea (NK) prep group status update to the full Committee. The CWMD in NK prep group had, through multiple meetings and visits with stakeholders, addressed many of the issues raised in the Terms of Reference (TOR). The prep group was tasked with examining the DoD's enduring WMD elimination mission, readiness, and coordination with the Republic of Korea (ROK). This included how roles, responsibilities, and capabilities will evolve in the coming years, among the military services, U.S. Strategic Command (USSTRATCOM), U.S. Pacific Command (USPACOM), United States Forces Korea (USFK), Defense Threat Reduction Agency (DTRA), the ROK, and other relevant entities. The focus of the group is to assess whether there are sufficient technical capabilities, political tools, and agreements in place for a rapid response and effective elimination of NK's WMD. The prep group announced their upcoming meeting with the new leadership of USFK and follow on meetings with USPACOM, the Asan Institute, U.S. Embassy Seoul, and the Center for Strategic and International Studies Pacific Forum.

Following the CWMD in NK update, Mr. Henry Hollatz, Director of the National Counterproliferation Center provided a classified brief on global CWMD intelligence issues. His briefing included an overview of the Center's ten year history, structure of the Center, how it interacts with the greater Intelligence Community, areas that need greater effort but might not be high priority for individual intelligence organizations, and how the Center maximizes WMD counterproliferation effort with minimal manpower.

Mr. James Baker, Director, Office of Net Assessment (ONA), briefed issues under consideration by ONA. His brief led the membership to question why there has not been an assessment of nuclear weapons. Members encouraged Mr. Baker to challenge traditional understanding of non-U.S. actors' actions in war games to better prepare U.S. assets and leaders. Mr. Baker's response suggested that over the last 8 years, ONA priorities were driven by the Chairman of the Joint Chiefs of Staff's concern for near term (6 month) issues. Under new guidance, this will change and assessments more in line with historical long term issues will also be studied. After an engaging discussion of issues, Amb. Lehman thanked Mr. Baker for taking time to meet with the TRAC and suggested there was opportunity for the Committee to collaborate with ONA in the future.

Following Mr. Baker's briefing, Amb. Robert Joseph and Dr. Miriam John discussed the DTRA Futures prep group activities. Dr. John summarized the recent briefing to Dr. Arthur T. Hopkins, (Principal Deputy Assistant Secretary of Defense for Nuclear, Chemical, and Biological Defense Programs) and others on his staff on Leadership and Management of the CWMD mission and emphasized that the findings and recommendations of the prep group were by and large supported by Dr. Hopkins. She then gave a rundown of the DTRA Futures prep group including background, findings, and recommendations. Amb. Lehman then recommended that the results of the DTRA Futures prep group be accepted by the Committee as is. His proposal was seconded and an open vote by raised hand resulted in unanimous agreement.

The conclusion of the DTRA Futures prep group transitioned into Amb. Lehman providing remarks about Amb. Joseph's rotation off the TRAC. He cited Amb. Joseph's invaluable contributions to the Committee and to the CWMD mission since its inception. Dr. John concurred, noting it was a pleasure to work with him as a co-leader of the DTRA Futures prep group.

The first day concluded with the individual prep group leaders meeting to plan and prepare remarks for the Senior Leader out brief to Hon. Frank Kendall, Under Secretary of Defense for Acquisition, Technology, and Logistics (USD/AT&L), for the following day.

On day two, the co-leaders for the recently established CWMD in China and CWMD in Russia prep groups gave a short synopsis of their individual TORs, their projected timeline for meetings and briefings, and their plan for providing a product to the new Administration. After their remarks, Amb. Lehman made a few suggestions for honing their portions of the brief to USD Kendall.

The prep group briefs were followed by General (Gen) Michael Carns, (retired). Gen Carns provided the TRAC with a secret level briefing on his recent National Defense University Capstone Course activities. He opened by discussing a meeting between the U.S. Ambassador to China, Chinese government leaders, and representatives from three think tanks. Gen Carns provided many insights gleaned from his trips going back to 1997 on operations in the South China Sea.

He then transitioned to a discussion about Russia and regional issues related to CWMD stemming from his visits to the Ukraine, Moldova, Estonia, Belgium, and NATO Headquarters.

During the lunch hour, Dr. Hopkins joined the meeting to discuss activities, and concerns from his office. He provided the TRAC with an update on the Unified Command Plan changes for the CWMD mission and suggested that a forthcoming Presidential decision would move the mission from USSTRATCOM to U.S. Special Operations Command by the fall. Dr. Hopkins touched on a number of classified issues and reiterated the importance of the TRAC work and its value to the Department.

Following the lunch discussion with Dr. Hopkins, the meeting was suspended so members could make their way to the Pentagon for the Senior Leader out brief to USD Kendall. The meeting with USD Kendall took place in the Cables Conference Room to enable discussion at levels above secret. Amb. Lehman opened the meeting and introduced the three new TRAC members to USD Kendall. He then turned the meeting over to the Under Secretary for opening remarks. USD Kendall discussed transition year issues, the budget proposed by the Secretary of Defense, and recent meetings with members of the U.S. Congress. He concluded his remarks by saying he was committed to the office he was appointed to and would stay on through the election if permitted to do so.

USD Kendall then asked the Principal Deputy Undersecretary of Defense for Policy, Honorable (Hon.) Brian McKeon, if he had anything to add. After Hon. McKeon's remarks, USD Kendall further explained that the problems facing the U.S. are very different from previous challenges; Asia is an air/sea problem while Europe is presenting a land/air problem and North Korea is all of the above with the added elements of cyber and space. Hon. Michael Nacht inquired about DoD's plan for addressing the innovation challenges. In response, USD Kendall explained that the Department was pursuing ten efforts, primarily in Silicon Valley. He also asked for his staff to show the TRAC the Russia, China, and U.S. military modernization charts.

Amb. Lehman then introduced Dr. John as co-lead of the DTRA Futures prep group. Dr. John stated the contents of the forthcoming report had been deliberated upon and approved by the full Committee the previous day. She provided the group with an overview of the tasking and then highlighted the key findings. She congratulated DTRA as the principal go-to agency for addressing a full range of WMD threats and events. During a time when CWMD is becoming less episodic and more routine, DTRA is managing the increased demand signals and is the recognized home of expertise, both technically and in operational support. Dr. John went on to highlight changes that should be made in terms of leadership, policy, organization, research and development priorities and finally, career progression pathways for CWMD experts at DTRA. She then assured USD Kendall that after he received the final report, DTRA would also be briefed on the findings.

Following Dr. John's brief, Amb. Lehman introduced the "CWMD in NK" prep group leadership; Hon. Nacht and Ms. Eileen Vergino. They both stressed that due to the many uncertainties surrounding NK there was still much work to complete. The prep group needed to clarify several questions to include: the division of labor between U.S. and the Republic of Korea; how third parties might play a role; what a leadership change in NK might cause; and finally, clarity on the priority of the parties involved in the reunification of the peninsula. They then outlined their proposed way ahead.

The CWMD in NK discussion was followed by similar updates by the co-leaders from both the China and Russia prep groups. Each group summarized a prioritized list of objectives taken from the TOR signed by USD Kendall and a plan to have a product by the end of the calendar year to present to the incoming Administration. USD Kendall recommended a shorter timeline as the transition teams are expected in the Pentagon immediately following the November election and would be looking for big picture updates.

USD Kendall concluded the briefing by welcoming the new TRAC members again and restating the need for the TRAC to have something ready for the transition teams, post-election. After the Under Secretary left the conference room, Amb. Lehman adjourned the plenary meeting at 1515 on May 6, 2016.

ANNEX A: Thirty-Seventh Plenary Meeting Agenda

Thursday, May 5, 2016

CENTRA Technology, Inc., 3RD Floor, SCIF

DISCUSSIONS CONDUCTED AT OR ABOVE THE SECRET CLASSIFICATION LEVEL

0800	Sign In / Breakfast	
0830	Designated Federal Officer Remarks	Mr. Hostyn/TRAC
0835	Chairman's Remarks on TRAC Activities	Amb. Lehman
0850	NCB Defense Program Remarks ~TS-SCI	Dr. Hopkins
0930	Break	
0945	Intelligence Briefings on North Korea ~TS-SCI	Mr. Heil, DIA, NGA, AFTAC
1200	Working Lunch	
1300	Global CWMD Intelligence Issues ~ TS/SCI	Mr. Hollatz
1415	Break	
1430	Office of Net Assessment, China and Russia	Mr. Baker
1530	TRAC Preparatory Groups ~ SECRET	TRAC ONLY
	CWMD Leadership & Management	Dr. John/Amb. Joseph
	DTRA Futures	Dr. John/Amb. Joseph
	CWMD in North Korea	Hon Nacht/Ms. Vergino
1630	Discuss TRAC Findings for Senior Leader Meeting	TRAC ONLY
1700	Adjourn	

Friday, May 6, 2016

CENTRA Technology, Inc. 3rd Floor, SCIF & Pentagon Cables Room, 3D921

DISCUSSIONS CONDUCTED AT OR ABOVE THE SECRET CLASSIFICATION LEVEL

0800 Sign-In/Breakfast

0830 TRAC Preparatory Groups ~ SECRET

CWMD in China Preparatory Group Next Steps Hon. Benkert/Dr. Choi

CWMD in Russia Preparatory Group Next Steps Hon. Koch/Dr. Reichart

1015 Break

1030 Russia and Regional Issues Related to CWMD ~ SECRET General Carns, USAF, Retired

1130 Working Lunch ~~ discussion continues through lunch TRAC ONLY

1245 Transport to Pentagon Cables Room 3D921

1400 Senior Leader Out Brief ~ TS/SCI Amb. Lehman

Preparatory Group Discussions

DTRA Futures Dr. John/Amb. Joseph

CWMD in North Korea Hon. Nacht/Ms. Vergino

CWMD in China Hon. Benkert/Dr. Choi

CWMD in Russia Hon. Koch/Dr. Reichart

1500 Adjourn

ANNEX B: Thirty-Seventh Plenary Meeting Attendees

Mr. Brad Ahlskog	Mr. Henry Hollatz
Major Nathaniel Allen	Mr. Randall Holmes
Mr. James Baker	Dr. Arthur Hopkins
Honorable Joseph A. Benkert	Mr. William Hostyn
Rear Admiral Kenneth W. Bernard, USPHS, Retired	Dr. Miriam John
Dr. Joseph V. Braddock	Ambassador Robert G. Joseph
Deputy Assistant Secretary of Defense John Burnham	Honorable Susan J. Koch
General Mike Carnes, USAF, Retired	Dr. Michael Kuliasha
Dr. Melissa G. Choi	Ambassador Ronald Lehman
Mr. James Collins	Honorable Michael E. Leiter
Mr. Christopher Davis	Dr. Vahid Majidi
Mr. Stephen Dowling	Mr. David Merker
Ms. Wendy Eaton	Honorable Michael Nacht
Honorable Richard A. Falkenrath	Dr. John F. Reichart
Mr. Timothy Genda	Ms. Anne Renner
Ms. Donna Gregg	Mr. Ed Reynolds
Mr. Chris Grisafe	Ms. Joan B. Rohlfing
Dr. Gigi K. Gronvall	Dr. Glen Sjoden
Dr. Ronald Hann	Dr. Jeffrey M. Starr
Dr. David Hassell	Ms. Eileen S. Vergino
Ms. Mary Alice A. Hayward	Dr. Steven Wax
Mr. Stephen Heil	Mr. Aaron Wessells
	Colonel Christopher Worley
	Dr. George M. Whitesides

ANNEX B: Thirty-seventh Plenary Meeting Attendees

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY BLANK

ANNEX C: Threat Reduction Advisory Committee Membership

Chairperson

Ambassador Ronald F. Lehman II

Vice-Chairperson

Dr. Miriam E. John

Members

Honorable Graham Allison

Ambassador Robert G. Joseph

Honorable Joseph A. Benkert

Lieutenant General Francis H. Kearney, III,
USA, Retired

Rear Admiral Kenneth W. Bernard, USPHS,
Retired

Honorable Susan J. Koch

Dr. Joseph V. Braddock

Honorable Michael E. Leiter

Dr. Melissa G. Choi

Honorable Michael Nacht

Honorable Richard A. Falkenrath

Dr. John F. Reichart

Ms. Donna Gregg

Ms. Joan B. Rohlfing

Dr. Gigi K. Gronvall

Dr. Jeffrey M. Starr

Vice Admiral Robert S. Harward, USN, Retired

Ms. Eileen S. Vergino

Ms. Mary Alice A. Hayward

Dr. George M. Whitesides

Ms. Jill M. Hruby

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY BLANK

ANNEX D: TRAC Management Staff

Mr. William P. Hostyn, Director, (703) 767-4453, william.p.hostyn.civ@mail.mil *

Mr. Stephen J. Polchek, Deputy Director, (703) 767-8891, stephen.j.polchek.civ@mail.mil *

MAJ Nathaniel A. Allen, Operations Officer, (703) 767-5149, nathaniel.a.allen.mil@mail.mil

Mr. Randall D. Holmes, (703) 767-5714, randall.d.holmes2.civ@mail.mil *

Ms. Wendy L. Eaton, (703) 767-0026, wendy.l.eaton.ctr@mail.mil

Mr. James B. Collins, (703) 767-5957, james.b.collins2.ctr@mail.mil

Ms. Anne E. Renner, (703) 767-2597, anne.e.renner.ctr@mail.mil

**Designated Federal Officer*

Please direct all inquiries to the TRAC Management Staff

